



A Tradition of Stewardship  
A Commitment to Service

Agenda Date: 7/1/2009

Agenda Placement: 9A

## Napa County Planning Commission Board Agenda Letter

---

**TO:** Napa County Planning Commission  
**FROM:** John McDowell for Hillary Gitelman - Director  
Conservation, Development & Planning  
**REPORT BY:** John McDowell, Deputy Director - 299-1354  
**SUBJECT:** Napa Valley Country Club Use Permit Major Modification #P08-00381-MOD

---

### **RECOMMENDATION**

#### **NAPA VALLEY COUNTRY CLUB 12 AF RESERVOIR / NAPA VALLEY COUNTRY CLUB, LLC. - USE PERMIT MAJOR MODIFICATION P08-00381-MOD**

**CEQA Status:** Subsequent Mitigated Negative Declaration Prepared – According to the proposed Subsequent Mitigated Negative Declaration, if mitigation measures are not included, the proposed project would have potentially significant environmental impacts in the following area: Biological Resources, Cultural Resources, Hazards and Hazardous Materials, and Hydrology and Water Quality. The project site is not on any of the lists of hazardous waste sites enumerated under Government Code section 65962.5.

**REQUEST:** Approval of a Use Permit Major Modification (P08-00381) to modify a prior Use Permit (U-58687), as amended, to add the following improvements to the Napa Valley Country Club Golf Course: 1) construction of a new 12 acre foot reservoir in the northwest corner of APN 052-130-041 to store groundwater for use in irrigating the Front Nine with no increase in the amount of groundwater extracted for golf course irrigation; and 2) the replacement and upgrade of the existing irrigation system for both the Front and Back Nine. The proposed project is located on a 183.58 acre holding on the south side of Hagen Road, approximately 0.30 miles east of its intersection with 3rd Avenue within an Agricultural Watershed (AW) zoning district, with general plan designations of Agriculture, Watershed, and Open Space (AWOS) and Rural Residential (RR). (Assessor's Parcel #s, 052-130-041 and 052-170-044). 3385 Hagan Road, Napa.

**Staff Recommendation:** Adopt the subsequent Mitigated Negative Declaration and approve the Use Permit Major Modification subject to mitigation measures and conditions of approval.

**Staff Contact:** Kelli Felker, 265-2325 [kfelker@co.napa.ca.us](mailto:kfelker@co.napa.ca.us)

***CONTINUED FROM THE JUNE 17, 2009 REGULAR COMMISSION MEETING***

## **EXECUTIVE SUMMARY**

### **Proposed Action:**

1. That the Planning Commission adopt the Mitigated Negative Declaration and Mitigation Monitoring Program for the Napa Valley County Club Reservoir Project, based on findings 1-6 of Exhibit A;
2. That the Planning Commission approve Major Modification P08-00381-MOD based on findings 7-11 of Exhibit A and subject to the recommended conditions of approval (Exhibit B).

### **Discussion:**

This proposed project is a Use Permit Modification (P08-00381-MOD) to modify the prior Use Permit (#U-58687) for the Napa Valley Country Club, as amended. This proposal requests 1) construction of a new 12 acre foot reservoir in the northwest corner of APN 052-130-041 to store groundwater for use in irrigating the Front Nine; and 2) the replacement and upgrade of the existing irrigation system for both the Front and Back Nine located in the unincorporated area of Napa County on two parcels totaling 183.58 acres south of Hagen Road, 1.2 miles east of the City of Napa. The Napa Valley Country Club (NVCC) has operated as a golf course and private country club for approximately 86 years. In 1987 Use Permit U-58687 was approved by the Planning Commission allowing the expansion of the 9-hole golf course to a total of 18 holes.

## **FISCAL IMPACT**

Is there a Fiscal Impact?                      No

## **ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACT**

**ENVIRONMENTAL DETERMINATION:** Subsequent Mitigated Negative Declaration Prepared – According to the proposed Subsequent Mitigated Negative Declaration, if mitigation measures are not included, the proposed project would have potentially significant environmental impacts in the following area: Biological Resources, Cultural Resources, Hazards and Hazardous Materials, and Hydrology and Water Quality. The project site is not on any of the lists of hazardous waste sites enumerated under Government Code section 65962.5

## **BACKGROUND AND DISCUSSION**

**Owner:** Napa Valley Country Club

**Representative (President):** Scott Zion

**Zoning:** AW (Agricultural Watershed)

**General Plan Designation:** AWOS (Agriculture, Watershed, and Open Space)

**Initially Submitted:** June 2, 2008    **Determination Complete:** January 5, 2009

**Reservoir Size (proposed):** 12 acre feet

**Current water usage:**

**Front nine:** 83.10 acre feet/year (ground water)  
**Back nine:** 116.8 acre feet/year (surface water)

**Proposed water usage:**

**Front nine:** 68.7 acre feet/year (ground water)  
**Back nine:** 102.8 acre feet/year (surface water)

**Visitation:** The Napa Valley Country Club is a members only club, there will be no change in membership or visitation.

**Adjacent Zoning / Land Use:**

North

RC – Rural Residential – including nine (9) residential 1 – 1.32 acre parcels on the north side of Hagen Road.

South

AW – Agricultural Watershed – including a 27 acre (Cain) rural residential parcel with vineyard, and a 10 acre (Dambrosio) residential parcel with vineyard.

East

AW – Agricultural Watershed – a 53.58 acre (Nickel Vineyard Company) parcel with vineyard, 24.23 acre (Darrin) parcel with residence, vineyard and winery, 0.74 acre (Palmaz) parcel with residence, 1.64 acre (Cash) parcel with residence, 21.25 acre (Graystone Ranch) parcel with residence, pasture, and barn/stables, 13.92 acres (GC Napa Properties, LLC) parcel with residence and vineyard, 15.15 acre (Carnevale and Gorman) parcel with residence and open space.

West

AW – Agricultural Watershed – including five (5) residential parcels between 1 – 1.41 acres, 32.57 acre (Maroon) parcel with residential, vineyard and open space, 45.98 acre (Lupine Hill Vineyards, LLC) parcel with winery and vineyard. Nearby Golf Courses (within 1.75 miles of the project site) Silverado Country Club and Resort Inc. – 1600 Atlas Peak Road, Napa (membership and open to the public)

**History and Evolution of this Application:**

1972 - The Planning Commission approved Use Permit U-16172, allowing the expansion of the clubhouse by constructing a viewing deck, and legalizing all existing uses as of 1972.

1975 - The Planning Commission approved Use Permit U-197575, allowing the construction of four tennis courts and paving associated parking.

1984 - The Planning Commission approved Use Permit U-248384, allowing the construction of a 3,000 sqft golf cart storage facility.

1987 - The Planning Commission approved Use Permit U-58687, expansion of the golf course by 9-holes (Back Nine) to a total of 18-holes.

1989 - The Planning Commission approved Use Permit U-458889, allowing the construction of a 60 foot by 120 foot tennis court.

1993 - The Planning Commission approved Use Permit Modification #93001, allowing the relocation of the practice driving range.

1994 - The Zoning Administrator approved Use Permit Modification #94027, allowing the construction of a 208 sqft restroom on the Back Nine, including leach field.

The Planning Commission approved Use Permit Modification #94250, allowing the redesign/realignment of Fairway #16, and the addition of a temporary hole #19, and request to construct two reservoirs on-site (Lake A and Lake B).

The Zoning Administrator approved Use Permit Modification #94289, to relocate the snack bar to the pool area, including construction of a single wall to enclose the partially enclosed area for a total area of 192 sqft.

The Zoning Administrator approved Use Permit Modification #94329, to allow the expansion of the existing 2,681 sqft deck by 1,450 additional sqft.

The Zoning Administrator approved Use Permit Modification #94355, to allow the construction of a 5,600 sqft metal golf cart storage facility and paved parking area (U-248384 expired)

1996 - The Zoning Administrator approved Use Permit Extension #96521, request for an extension of time for a multiple agency project involving creating a new 16th green and impounding surface water into two new reservoirs. (refer to #94250-MOD)

2000 - The Planning Commission approved Use Permit Modification #00441, to allow the demolition of the 8,000 sqft clubhouse and replace it with a 19,765 sqft clubhouse and remodel of pool house facility.

2002 - The Zoning Administrator approved Use Permit Modification #02143, to modify #00441-MOD allowing the use of temporary facilities during construction of the new Clubhouse facility, temporary cart storage, temporary bar and restroom, temporary office, and temporary admin bldg.

**Code Compliance History:** The County has no records of code compliance issues on this project.

### **Discussion Point(s):**

#### Project Setting and Background

The proposed reservoir project site is located in an area that consists of fairways, greens and landscaping associated with the golf course and country club. The Napa Valley Country Club (NVCC) has operated as a golf course and private country club for approximately 86 years, located in the unincorporated area of Napa County, approximately 1.2 miles east of the City of Napa on Hagen Road. The main access to the site is located off Hagen Road approximately 0.30 miles east of its intersection with 3rd Avenue, with secondary and maintenance access off Rapp Lane (Figure 1). The project is located within a 183.58 acre holding consisting of two contiguous parcels (APNs 052-130-041 & 052-170-044). The parcels are located in an Agricultural Watershed (AW) zoning district, with Napa County General Plan designation of Agriculture, Watershed and Open Space (AWOS). Currently the NVCC consists of an 18 hole golf course with clubhouse, tennis facilities, pool/spa, and facilities maintenance and operation storage. The 18 hole golf course is divided into two sections, including the Front Nine located north of the clubhouse (APN 052-130-041), and the Back Nine located south of the clubhouse (APN 052-170-044).

Similarly, the irrigation system has been divided into two sections with groundwater irrigating the Front Nine and surface water irrigating the Back Nine. According to the applicant, the irrigation systems were last upgraded over 20 years ago. In 2006, the irrigation system was evaluated and underwent monitoring to determine the average water usage and overall system efficiency. The monitoring results determined that due to poor sprinkler head spacing, pipe failures and control problems, the system was inefficient using an excess of between 28.04 and 33.41 acre feet per year (af/y), which is more than necessary to maintain the golf course. These results were

based on a comparison to the proposed upgraded irrigation system design by Russ Mitchell Associates.

The golf course, including both the Front and Back Nines currently use a combined average of approximately 200 af of groundwater and surface water annually. The Front Nine uses up to 79.9 af of groundwater, while the Back Nine is irrigate with surface water totaling 116.8 af/y. In addition to the irrigation system, there are currently several water storage facilities on-site, including a 200,000 gallon groundwater storage facility on the Front Nine, five existing surface water reservoirs located within the Back Nine, and additional storage tanks for domestic and fire protection storage. Groundwater is supplied through two existing on-site wells, one irrigation well located in the northeast corner of the holding that supplies groundwater to the Front Nine, and one domestic well supplies water for all domestic uses through a delivery system that is independent of the irrigation supply.

Implementation of the proposed project as described below would reduce groundwater and surface water usage by 28.4 af/y. This would reduce total groundwater usage to 65.5 af/y (or 14.4 af reduction in groundwater use annually). According to the Phase I Water Availability Analysis prepared for the project, the allowable groundwater allotment for the holding is 55.07 af/y. Post project projects indicate that groundwater extraction would continue to exceed current threshold for the holding by 10.43 af/y; however, based on historical groundwater usage, the holding has demonstrated that groundwater has been extracted at current levels prior to the adoption of the Groundwater Ordinance. Implementation of the proposed project would result in a decrease in groundwater extraction (see Table 1 below).

### Project Description

Based on the irrigation system monitoring results, the NVCC is proposing to upgrade the current irrigation system to increase water efficiency for the Front and Back Nine, and construct a new 12.0 af off-stream water reservoir to impound groundwater (herein referred to as Lake E). Lake E is primarily intended to provide for irrigation efficiencies through the reduction of pump timing and duration during peak extraction (i.e. Late Spring to Early Fall), and modify the existing sprinkler systems layout ultimately reducing the current amount of groundwater used for irrigation. The following discussion details the proposed project, including discussion of pre- and post project water uses (see Table 1 below).

### Proposed Reservoir (Lake E)

The Front Nine is currently irrigated by groundwater supplied by a single well located in the northeast corner of the holding. The well supplies an estimated 83.1 af annually for irrigation of the Front Nine and domestic landscaping, accounting for approximately 3.2 af/y. Groundwater is currently pumped and stored in a single 200,000 gallon water storage tank, which supplies irrigation to the Front Nine, and is centrally located east of Fairway #3. Proposed Lake E would be located in the northwest corner of the Front Nine, approximately 510 feet west of the groundwater well and connected directly by pipeline for impoundment of groundwater. The exact location of Lake E is proposed between Fairways #7 and #8 and will be used exclusively to irrigate the Front Nine only (Figure 2).

Construction of Lake E will include the excavation of approximately 16,000 to 19,300 cubic yards of soil, which will be temporarily stockpiled east of proposed Lake E and Fairway #7. According to the project engineer, test pits identified the subsoils to be excavated are composed of very fine clays, primarily weathered from rhyolite and found to be suitable material for reservoir construction. No material is proposed to be off-hauled from the site.

The excavated subsoil will be used for reservoir construction and in the reshaping of Fairway #7. Fairway #7 will have the existing topsoil removed and temporarily stockpiled for reuse, first using the excavated subsoil, then covered by the removed topsoil, and finally a seedbed laid for the new fairway grass. Eleven ornamental trees located west of Fairway #7 will be removed to accommodate proposed Lake E and reshaping of Fairway #7; however, no oak trees, special-status species or species of concern have been identified on-site, nor are any

proposed to be removed. Construction details for Lake E, including proposed overflow, containment and location of all project related trenching will be incorporated into the final design as part of the Grading Permit Application, in addition to the results of a geotechnical evaluation which will be submitted to and reviewed by the Napa County Public Works Department and the Conservation, Development and Planning Department in accordance with the findings and conditions of the subject Use Permit Major Modification.

### Proposed Upgraded Irrigation System

Currently, both surface and groundwater are used to irrigate the golf course and domestic landscaping. Surface water is stored in five existing reservoirs (or Lakes) (Appropriative License No. 13612 (A29017) and Appropriative Permit No. 20811 (A30303)), which are used exclusively to irrigate the Back Nine, the driving range, and the landscaping around the upper tennis facility (see Figure 2) (also refer to Attachment A). The five existing reservoirs have a combined holding capacity of 188.00 af, of which approximately 117.00 af is used annually. Groundwater to irrigate the Front Nine is currently stored in a single 200,000 gallon water storage tank, which is located within the Front Nine, east of Fairway #3. The groundwater storage tank is allowed to drain for regular maintenance and cleaning; otherwise the water storage tank typically remains at capacity.

The proposed upgraded irrigation system would include the replacement of all existing irrigation piping, the extension of 8 inch pipeline connecting existing reservoir and connecting the existing groundwater well to proposed Lake E, upgrade and re-spacing of sprinkler heads, and control systems. The irrigation system will also feature the ability to accommodate an alternate water supply (i.e. recycled water) through installation of purple piping, should the opportunity present itself in the future[1].

[1] The U.S. Department of Interior, Bureau of Reclamation and the North Bay Water Reuse Authority's Member Agency, including the Napa Sanitation District have prepared a Draft Environmental Impact Report/Environmental Impact Statement (EIR/EIS) analyzing the North Bay Recycled Water program for the construction and operations of the proposed upgrades to treatment processes, and construction of storage, pipelines and pump stations facilities to distribute recycled water (refer to Figure 2-7 of the draft EIR/EIS) for use in compliance with Article 4 in Title 22 of the California Code of Regulations.

### Conclusion

The inefficiencies within the existing irrigation system has been determined to waste between 28.04 and 33.41 af of water annually. Currently, total use averages 199.0 af/y of surface and groundwater for irrigating the Front Nine, Back Nine, and landscaping for the holding (see Table 1). The upgraded irrigation system and storage capacity of proposed Lake E would reduce current consumption to approximately 171.5 af/y, a reduction of 28.4 af/y (or 14.2%) for the holding. The proposed new irrigation system has been estimated to improve efficiency and reduce current groundwater usage by approximately 17.3% (or 14.4 af/y) on the Front Nine, and 12.0% (or 14.0 af/y) of surface water on the Back Nine.

In addition to reducing water usage, the project proponent proposes to construct an off-stream reservoir (Lake E) to store up to 12.0 af annually of the estimated 83.1 af of groundwater currently pumped annually. Groundwater would be pumped once annually and transferred directly into Lake E to full capacity or up to 12.0 af. Groundwater would be pumped during winter months only to reduce the potential for disruption or drawdown of nearby off-site domestic and irrigation wells, and conveyed from Lake E through the proposed new irrigation system via pump station, which will ensure system and water efficiency.

**Table 1  
Pre- and Post Project Water Use**

Water Area of Use & Source	Pre-Project		Total	Post Project		Total		
	Domestic (1)	Irrigation (2)	Existing Water Usage	Domestic	Irrigation	Long-Term Projections	Post Project Reduction	% Reduction
<b>Front Nine</b>								
<b>Groundwater</b>	3.2	79.9	83.1	3.2	65.5(3)	68.7	14.4	17.3%
<b>Back Nine</b>								
<b>Surface Water</b>	0.0	116.8	116.8	0.0	102.8(4)	102.8	14.0	12.0%
<b>Total Water Use</b>			199.9			171.5	28.4	14.2%
(1) Average 2,850 gallons per day (or 3.2 af/y) for all domestic use facilities, including the clubhouse, pool, tennis facilities, and two (2) on course restrooms. (2) Based on 2006 usage, reported October 2007. Usage includes golf course and landscape irrigation (3) 17.3% (14.4 af/y) reduction from pre-project groundwater usage. (4) 12% (14.0 af/y) reduction from pre-project surface water usage.								

**Consistency with Standards:**

Zoning and General Plan Consistency

The project is consistent with AW (Agricultural Watershed) zoning district regulations and the General Plan. A reservoir supplying irrigation water for the facility is considered an accessory use to an existing approved conditional use.

Public Works Department Requirements

A grading permit is required from Public Works prior to commencing construction

Environmental Management Department Requirements

Assistant Director Chistine Secheli has reviewed this application for the Department of Environmental Management and has no recommendations or conditions of approval. Please see memo of March 26, 2009.

**SUPPORTING DOCUMENTS**

None

Napa County Planning Commission: Approve

Reviewed By: John McDowell