



A Tradition of Stewardship
A Commitment to Service

Agenda Date: 6/6/2012

Agenda Placement: 9A

Napa County Planning Commission Board Agenda Letter

TO: Napa County Planning Commission

FROM: Charlene Gallina for Hillary Gitelman - Director
Conservation, Development & Planning

REPORT BY: Charlene Gallina, SUPERVISING PLANNER - 299-1355

SUBJECT: Cairdean Winery - Use Permit #P11-00298 & Variance #P11-00299

RECOMMENDATION

CAIRDEAN WINERY – EDWIN & STACIA WILLIAMS, USE PERMIT #P11-00298 & VARIANCE REQUEST #P11-00299

CEQA Status: Mitigated Negative Declaration Prepared. According to the Mitigated Negative Declaration, if mitigation measures are not included, the proposed project would have potentially significant effects in the following area(s): Biological Resources. The project site is not on any of the lists of hazardous waste sites enumerated under Government Code section 65962.5.

Requests: Two (2) Variance Requests to allow the construction of a new winery 259 feet from the centerline of State Route 29/128 (St. Helena Highway) road setback where 600 feet is required for a setback and 100 feet from the centerline of a private road (used by the public) where 300 feet is required for a setback. A Use Permit to establish a new 50,000 gallon per year winery with: 1) a winery building with total coverage of 61,221sf (+/- 19,390sf production area (single story) and +/- 2,500sf admin area including +/- 250sf tasting room, +/- 230sf employee break room); 2) +/-13,000sf of caves (including +/- 340sf wine library, +/- 450 case good storage, and +/- 12,210 barrel storage); 3) +/- 3,700sf of covered work area; 4) +/- 2,000sf of covered crush pad; 5) +/- 22,300sf of new access paving (including one-way loop driveway, parking spaces, walkways, loading area); 6) a gated access; 7) 14 parking spaces (including 1 ADA-accessible space); 8) a 1-acre of vineyard; 9) a new winery domestic and process wastewater treatment and disposal system (including a 10,500 gallon domestic water tank, a 10,500 gallon irrigation tank and a 65,000 gallon recycled water holding tank and other various smaller tanks as needed); 10) a 40,000 gallon fire water tank; 11) a landscaping program that includes a green roof, vineyard plantings, native & drought tolerant plants; 12) +/- 14,000 cubic yards of cave spoil to be disposed on-site or hauled off-site to Clover Flats or another location; 13) fourteen (14) employees (four (4) Full-Time, six (6) Part-Time, and four (4) Harvest); 14) tasting hours: 9:30-6:30 p.m.; seven days per week; 15) tours & tasting with catered food @ 25 person maximum per day; 16) a marketing plan with catered food: (2-25 person events per month; 2-50 person events per month; 2-100 person events per year, and participation in the Napa Valley Wine Auction up to 25 persons); 17) on-premise wine consumption pursuant to AB 2004; and 18) demolition of four existing structures (a single-family

residence, a agricultural barn, a garage and a pool house)

The 50.31 acre project site is located on the south side of Napa County on St Helena Highway (State Route 29/128) approximately 1,300 feet north of its intersection with Lodi Lane within the Agricultural Watershed Zoning District, and is addressed as 3125 St. Helena Highway, St. Helena (APN 022-070-028).

Staff Recommendation: Adopt the Mitigated Negative Declaration and approve the requested Variances and Use Permit as conditioned.

Staff Contact: Charlene Gallina, Supervising Planner; (707) 299-1355; charlene.gallina@countyofnapa.org

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

Proposed Actions:

That the Planning Commission:

1. Adopt the Mitigated Negative Declaration and Mitigation Monitoring Program for the Cairdean Winery Variance requests and Use Permit application based on Findings 1-6 of Exhibit A;
2. Approve Variance (#P11-00299) based on Findings 7-11 of Exhibit A; and
3. Approved Use Permit (#P11-00298) based on Findings 12-16 of Exhibit A and subject to the recommended Conditions of Approval (Exhibit B).

Discussion: The applicant requests approval of a use permit to demolish an existing residence and other structures for the construction of a new 50,000 gallon per year winery to be housed in two modules, (19,390 sq.ft. production area and a 2,500 sq.ft. administrative building connected by a roofed work area where crush activity will take place), and in a 13,000 sq.ft. cave, which will be constructed within the hillside area immediately south of the winery complex. The proposed Cairdean Winery would have up to 25 by appointment Tours and Tastings visitors daily and a Marketing Plan with 51 events annually. A variance is also being requested to allow the construction of the new winery within the road setback for State Route 29/128 (St. Helena Highway) and within the setback requirement for a private road used by the public. Staff recommends approval of the project and finds the project consistent with the Napa County Winery Definition Ordinance and other applicable provisions of the Zoning Ordinance and General Plan, subject to standard conditions of approval.

FISCAL IMPACT

Is there a Fiscal Impact? No

ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACT

Mitigated Negative Declaration Prepared. According to the proposed Mitigated Negative Declaration, if mitigation measures are not included, the proposed project would have potentially significant environmental impacts in the following area: Biological Resources. The project site is not on any of the lists of hazardous waste sites

enumerated under Government Code Section 65962.5.

BACKGROUND AND DISCUSSION

Owner/Applicant: Edwin and Stacia Williams (707-200-1243)

Representatives: Juancarlos Fernandez, Juancarlos Fernandez Studio (707-963-8831), Jeffrey Redding, Planning Consultant (707-255-7375), Hugh Linn, Riechers Spence Associates (707-252-3301)

Zoning District: Agriculture Watershed (AW)

General Plan Designation: Agricultural, Watershed Open Space (AWOS)

Filed: August 2011, revised October 2011, December 6, 2011, February 20, 2012, April 2012

Complete: April 2012

Parcel Size: 50.31 acres

Proposed Winery Size: +/- 21,890 square feet (+/- 19,390sf production area and +/- 2,500sf administrative area, including a +/- 250sf tasting room and +/- 230sf employee break room)

Proposed Cave Size: +/- 13,000 square feet cave (+/- 340sf wine library, +/-450sf case good storage, +/-12,210sf barrel storage)

Proposed Production Capacity: 50,000 gallons per year

Proposed Winery Development Area: +/-16,620 square feet

Proposed Winery Coverage: +/- 61,221 square feet (1.40 acres) or 2.8% (Maximum 25% of parcel or 15 acres, whichever is less)

Proposed Accessory/Production Ratio: 12% (40% allowed)

Proposed Vineyard Acreage: 1 acre

Number of employees: 14 total (4 full-time, 6 part-time and 4 harvest)

Proposed Visitation: Tours & Tasting visitation to the proposed winery would be by-appointment, with a maximum of 25 persons per day. Any food service as part of the Tours & Tasting program will only be pre-prepared foods. On-premise consumption of wine may occur pursuant to AB 2004.

Proposed Marketing Program: Two 25-persons events per month; two 50-persons events per month; and two 100-person events per year. Food service at all marketing events will be catered using an off-site catering service. On-premise consumption of wine may occur consistent with AB 2004. On-premise consumption would occur in the tasting room and adjacent outdoor landscape area. No amplified music.

Days and hours of operations: Winery operations seven (7) per week from 7:30 a.m. to 6 p.m. Tours & Tastings hours seven (7) days per week from 9:30 a.m. to 6:30 p.m. Marketing Program Event hours from 10 a.m. to 10 p.m.

Parking: 14 spaces (including 1 ADA - accessible space)

Adjacent General Plan Designation/Zoning District/Land Use:

North: Agricultural, Watershed, & Open (AWOS) & Agricultural Resource (AR) General Plan Designation; Agricultural Preserve (AP) Zoning District; Land Uses - State Route 29/128 (St Helena Highway), Trinchero Napa Valley Winery, and vineyards.

East: Agricultural, Watershed, & Open (AWOS) General Plan Designation; Commercial Limited (CL) & Agriculture Watershed (AW) Zoning Districts; Land Uses - Commercial development (Marketplace, formerly St Helena Outlets), rural residential and douglas fir/oak woodlands forest.

South: Agricultural, Watershed, & Open (AWOS) General Plan Designation; Agriculture Watershed (AW) Zoning District; Land Use - Rural residential and douglas fir/oak woodlands forest.

West: Agricultural, Watershed, & Open (AWOS) General Plan Designation; Agriculture Watershed (AW) Zoning District; Land Use – Vineyards and douglas fir forest.

Wineries in the Vicinity (located within 1 mile of the project):

Vineyard 29 – 2927 St. Helena Highway; Producing 48,500 gallons per year; By appointment
Grace Family Winery – 1210 Rockland Drive; Producing 7,000 gallons per year; By appointment
Freemark Abbey – 3022 St. Helena Highway; Producing 60,000 gallons per year; Open to the public
Trinchero Napa Valley; 3070 St. Helena Highway; Producing 100,000 gallons per year; Open to the public
Ehlers Estate Winery – 3222 Ehlers Lane; Producing 25,000 gallons per year; Open to the public
Tilley Winery – 3199 St. Helena Highway; Producing 20,000 gallons per year; By appointment
Metzger Vineyards - 3243 St. Helena Highway; Producing 800 gallons per year; No tastings
Macauley Vineyards – 3291 St. Helena Highway; Producing 8,000 gallons per year; By appointment

Property History: The parcel has been associated with agriculture activities since the late 1800's as part of a larger land holding. Since the 1940's, the parcel has been in its configuration with the residential structures (a house, a barn, a garage, and a pool house) on the front approximately 2 acres of the parcel with the remaining 48 acres in its natural habitat of douglas fir and oak woodland. A historic structure evaluation was conducted with the conclusion that none of the structures were of historic value.

Code Compliance History: The County has no record of any code compliance issues on this property.

Discussion Points:

1. Setting - The project is proposed on a 50.31 acre parcel located on the south side of St. Helena Highway (State Route 29/128) approximately 1,300 feet north of its intersection with Lodi Lane. The property is an irregularly shaped parcel with elevations that range from 300 to 700 feet on the east facing slopes. The property is presently developed with a single family residence with associated infrastructure, some residential landscaping, three accessory structures (an agricultural barn, pool house, and garage), a reservoir, fallow agricultural grassland, an access road to the west edge of the parcel and natural habitat of oak woodland, douglas fir forest and a small area of chaparral. The existing residence and other structures are not visible from SR29/128. These structures are up gradient, set back from SR29/128 approximately 120 feet and screened by the existing mature trees along the parcel boundary on SR 29/128.

Surrounding land uses consists of vineyards, wineries, rural residential oak woodlands and conifer woodlands and a commercial business complex (the Marketplace, formerly St Helena Outlets). It should be noted that this complex is currently undergoing renovations and a rearrangement of previously approved uses. Permits issued or on file are for re-roof of all 5 buildings, and a remodel of Building 3 for a 100-seat restaurant. These renovations are within the existing structures. There are no anticipated changes at this time in previously approved uses, intensification of uses, or any expansion of the wastewater system and/or in the parking area or circulation pattern.

2. New Winery Proposal – The existing residence and other structures will be demolished, and the area would become a winery, a parking area, and a one acre vineyard. There are no changes proposed to the existing entrance. The existing entrance on SR 29/128 provides access to the proposed winery parcel and the adjacent parcel. The winery parcel is located on the west side and the Marketplace is on the east side of the entrance. The existing entrance is approximately 50 feet in width and 170 feet in length. The rest of the property will remain in its natural environment consisting of douglas fir and oak woodland habitat. The existing mature trees along the SR 29/128 will also remain.

The proposed winery is to be housed in two modules, a 19,390 sq.ft. production area and a 2,500 sq.ft. administrative building connected by a roofed work area where crush activity will take place. The winery complex is designed to be low profile and curvilinear so as to blend with the adjacent hillside. The circular roof elements and clearstory windows allow natural light to penetrate into the interior of the production building. Barrels would be stored in the proposed 13,000 sq.ft. cave, which will be constructed within the hillside area immediately south of the winery complex. Material of construction will be metal siding, formed concrete, plaster and stone veneer, folding glass doors, a green & metal roof.

3. Setback Variance Requests – Physical constraints of the property which include steep topographic conditions that impact the majority of the property, numerous mature trees and vegetation, water features located on the southern portion of the property, and the inordinate width to depth ratio present on the property provides limited access to flat ground all of which are located within the 600 feet of SR 29/128 and 300 feet of the private road which is shared by the Marketplace. As proposed, the winery would be set back approximately 259 feet from the parcel boundary on SR 29/128 and would not be viewed by the traveling public on SR 29/128 as the project site is up gradient from its entrance on SR 29/128, and would not be seen due the intervening terrain. The traveling public southbound on SR 29/128 could have a brief glimpse of the project site. They would see the proposed vineyard, and a low profile, single story winery structure which contains a green roof. The northbound traveling public would view the existing matures trees along SR 29/128, and the existing entrance driveway. Viewshed analysis was prepared illustrating that upon completion the winery would not likely be seen by the majority traveling public. Seen as a whole, nothing in this project would substantially alter a scenic vista or substantially degrade the existing visual character of the site or its immediate surroundings.

4. Greenhouse Gas Reduction Strategies – The applicant team has completed the Department's Greenhouse Gas Emission Reduction Worksheet, which is attached to this report (Attachment D). The County's Draft Climate Action Plan would require discretionary projects to reduce their GHG emissions to 38% below "business as usual" volumes as of 2020 through the application of a combination of State, local, and project-specific programs and policies. Because the Draft Climate Action Plan has not yet been formally adopted, it cannot be considered a formal threshold of significance for CEQA purposes. Nonetheless, the project was analyzed for consistency with the Draft Climate Action Plan.

The project's "business as usual" emissions were calculated by Planning staff using CalEEMod GHG modeling software, resulting in modeled annual emissions of 297 metric tons of and carbon dioxide equivalents (MT CO₂e). The applicant intends to incorporate into the proposed project GHG reduction methods including: solar panels, use of a cave, recycled-water irrigation with zero-potable water use, on-site winery waste treatment and disposal system, roof top landscaping, landscaping with native plants, and high efficiency HVAC systems. Given the

proposed reduction measures incorporated into the project combined with local programs such as application of the CalGreen Building Code, and tightened vehicle fuel efficiency standards, the applicant would be able to reduce emissions well below the “business as usual” level. As modeled, this project would exceed the 38% reduction target by approximately 68 MT CO_{2e}.

Consistency with Standards:

Zoning – The project is consistent with AW (Agricultural Watershed) Zoning District regulations. A winery (as defined in the Napa County Code Section 18.08.640) and uses in connection with a winery (refer to Napa County Code Section 18.20.030) are permitted in the AW District with an approved use permit. A variance is required to allow the construction of a new winery within the required six hundred foot setback from the centerline of State Route 29/128 (St. Helena Highway) and within the required three hundred foot setback from the centerline of a private road used by the public (refer to Napa County Code Section 18.104.230). Staff is recommending approval of the variance request. The project as conditioned complies with the Napa County Winery Definition Ordinance and all other requirements of the Zoning Code as applicable.

Department of Public Works – Recommends approval with standard conditions in attached Memorandum dated May 8, 2012 and September 6, 2011.

Department of Environmental Management – Recommends approval with standard conditions in the attached Memorandum dated April 12, 2012.

Building Inspection Division - Recommends approval with standard conditions in the attached Memorandum dated November 16, 2011.

Fire Department – Recommends approval with standard conditions in the attached Inter-Office Memo dated September 1, 2011.

SUPPORTING DOCUMENTS

- A . Exhibit A - Findings
- B . Exhibit B - Conditions of Approval
- C . Department Comments
- D . Greenhouse Gas Emissions & Reduction Analysis
- E . Initial Study - Mitigated Negative Declaration
- F . Blue Oak Dispersion Field Abstract
- G . Biological Resource Survey
- H . Application Packet
- I . Graphics

Napa County Planning Commission: Approve

Reviewed By: John McDowell