Attachment G

Correspondence

Holman Teague real estate law · land use law · business law · climate change law

August 13, 2020

Napa County Board of Supervisors 1195 Third Street, Suite 310 Napa, California 94559

Delivery via email to: Diane.Dillon@countyofnapa.org

RE: Appeals of the Planning Commission approval of the Anthem Winery Project (P14-00320-MOD, P14-000322-ECPA)

Chair Dillon:

In reviewing the submitted witness list for Appellant Patricia Damery, I noted that a listed witness, Jeanne Chinn, did not verbally address the Planning Commission or submit written comments. As confirmed by Deputy County Counsel in an email dated August 10, 2020, no party has submitted a timely request to overrule the Chair's good cause determination dated July 10, 2020. Therefore, the Board's review of these appeals will be based entirely on the record before the Planning Commission.

Applicants' witnesses will confine their remarks to the documentary record (i.e. submitted documents and transcribed proceedings) before the Planning Commission. To the extent that Appellant Damery's listed witnesses (or other witnesses) intend to verbally provide new evidence to augment the documentary record, Applicants would object to such testimony as contrary to the Chair's good cause determination and Napa County Code §2.88.090.

Respectfully,

Rob Anglin

cc: Chris Apallas Kathy Felch Kevin Block Julie Arbuckle



August 18, 2020

Napa County Supervisors c/o Donald Barrella 1195 Third Street, Room 210 Napa, CA 94559 Donald.Barrella@countyofnapa.org

RE: In Support of Anthem Winery's Application to Modify Its Use Permit

Dear Supervisors,

I write in support of Julie and Justin Arbuckle's application to modify Anthem Winery's Use Permit. I understand that the Planning Commission unanimously approved the Arbuckles' application to: 1) substantially improve the safety of their winery's access road; 2) build a larger winery facility; and 3) allow tastings by appointment and occasional events instead of just 5 tastings a week. I hope that the Board will affirm the Planning Commission's unanimous approval of this project for several reasons.

<u>First</u>, the visitation and event levels approved are modest, especially when compared to similarly sized wineries that have come before the Planning Commission in the past decade. <u>Second</u>, the Arbuckles substantially reduced the scope of their project to address neighbor concerns, and at the request of several neighbors, agreed to withdraw their request for *any* increase in their currently permitted 30,000-gallon annual production limit. <u>Third</u>, the project incorporates an exemplary number of green, sustainability, and safety measures, including:

- The use of *less* water than currently permitted through substantial rainwater harvesting, recycling of winery process water, and a water-efficient underground irrigation system.
- An improved two lane access road that will have much better access for emergency vehicles and that will enable access between Redwood Rd. and Dry Creek Rd., as well as to neighboring parcels in the emergencies such as fires, landslides, and earthquakes a valuable benefit to the community.



- A wine production facility and caves that are built into the hillside near the center of the Arbuckles' property, minimizing the visibility and size of buildings to be located on the hilltop.
- A certified Napa Green winery in addition to the existing Napa Green vineyards.
- Numerous Best Management Practices and greenhouse gas reduction measures, including the solar rooftops, electric vehicle charging, and the plan to encourage employees and customers to carpool or ride their bikes.

It is hard to believe that in the middle of the current Covid crisis a small group of people continue to protest projects of this caliber. The *North Bay Business Journal* announced this morning that Yelp showed 239 businesses have closed in the Napa Santa Rosa areas. I cannot imagine people finding something wrong with growing the tax base and creating more jobs in the face of historic unemployment and financial ruin. It is time for our elected officials to defend the wine industry and our community and send a powerful message that special interests will not ruin the Valley's success.

Thank you for your time and consideration of these important issues, and for the opportunity to express my views. I sincerely hope that the Board affirms the Planning Commission's unanimous approval of Anthem Winery's application to modify its use permit so that the Arbuckles can proceed with their small winery project.

Sincerely,

Chis Indeficito

President/CEO Delicato Family Wines

Steven Rea 1114 Petra Dr. Napa, CA 94558

August 17, 2020

Napa County Supervisors c/o Donald Barrella 1195 Third Street, Room 210 Napa, CA 94559 Donald.Barrella@countyofnapa.org

RE: In Support of Anthem Winery's Application to Modify Its Use Permit

Dear Supervisors,

Thank you for all your work in support of the County in hard times and easy times.

I'd like to offer my strong support of Julie and Justin Arbuckle's application to modify Anthem Winery's Use Permit. After so many years of communications, hearing, making concessions all to try to make a living in the wine industry, I'd like to offer the support of the Planning Commission's unanimous approval of their application.

When someone follows the County established Codes, guidelines and best practices set forth for the wine industry, which is such a core cultural and economic support of the Valley, it seems that by now these should be simple and easy approvals. If nimbys want to change the County Code to not allow any wineries or vineyards then there is a process for that. Until then, it seems only fair and right to honor the established Code and respect the tremendous effort of applicants like the Arbuckles, who go above and beyond what the Code requires in some unachievable hope of appeasing unappeasable nimbys.

Your jobs are very tough, listening to so many loud voices in the land use arena, but when it comes down to it, it just seems that the answer is very simple. Please stand by our established Code and affirm the Planning Commission's unanimous decision.

Thank you,

Steven Rea



Alex Ryan President & CEO 1201 Dowdell Lane St. Helena, CA 94574

August 20, 2020

Napa County Supervisors c/o Donald Barrella 1195 Third Street, Room 210 Napa, CA 94559 Donald.Barrella@countyofnapa.org

RE: In Support of Anthem Winery' Application to Modify Its Use Permit

Dear Supervisors,

I write this letter in support of Julie and Justin Arbuckle's application to modify Anthem Winery's Use Permit. It is my understanding that the Planning Commission unanimously approved the Arbuckle's application to a) improve the safety of their winery's access road; b) build a larger winery facility, and c) allow tasting by appointment and occasional events instead of just five tastings per week. I hope that the Board will support the Planning Commission's unanimous approval of this project for multiple reasons.

First, their level of visitation and events are modest, when compared to similarly sized wineries that have come before the Planning Commission in the past. Second, the Arbuckle's substantially reduced the scope of their project to address their neighbor's concerns. At the request of several neighbors, the Arbuckle's agreed to withdraw their request for an increase to their current permitted 30,000-gallon annual production limit. Lastly, the project includes a number of green, sustainability and safety measures, including:

- the use of less water than currently permitted through rainwater harvesting, recycling of winery processed water, and a water-efficient irrigation system.

-improved two-lane access road that will provide improved access for emergency vehicles and enable access between Redwood Road and Dry Creek Road as well as to neighboring parcels in an emergency such as fire, landslide, and earthquake- a valuable benefit to the broader community.

-wine production facility and caves that are built into the hillside near the center of the Arbuckle's property, reducing the visibility and size of buildings to be located on the hilltop.

-a certified Napa Green winery in addition to the existing Napa Green vineyards.

-numerous Best Management Practices and greenhouse gas reduction measured, including solar rooftops, EV charging, and the plan to encourage employees and customers to carpool or ride their bikes.



All these sustainable measures make Anthem Winery's project one that should be approved. Napa County's General Plan is clear that agriculture is the best use of land and the Arbuckle's thoughtful planning maximizes the agricultural use of their land, while at the same, reduces their approved water use and improves emergency ingress and egress to and from the surrounding hillside.

Thank you for your time and consideration of these issues, and for the opportunity to share my views. I hope that the Board affirms the Planning Commission's unanimous approval of Anthem Winery's application to modify its use permit so that the Arbuckle's can proceed with their small winery project.

Respectfully,

etk

Alex Ryan President | Chief Executive Officer | Chairman Duckhorn Portfolio Duckhorn Vineyards | Decoy | Goldeneye | Migration | Paraduxx | Canvasback | Calera | Kosta Browne

August 25, 2020

Napa County Supervisors c/o Donald Barrella 1195 Third Street, Room 210 Napa, CA 94559 Donald.Barrella@countyofnapa.org

RE: In Support of Anthem Winery's Application to Modify Its Use Permit

Dear Supervisors,

I urge you to support Julie and Justin Arbuckle's application to modify Anthem Winery's Use Permit that the Planning Commission unanimously approved last year.

Please know the Arbuckles have substantially reduced the scope of their project to address neighbor concerns, and at the request of several neighbors, they agreed to withdraw their request for any increase in their currently permitted 30,000 gallon annual production limit.

The Arbuckles have also compromised with the neighbors by withdrawing a road variance and reducing visitation to an average of 21 visitors a day. The larger winery facility that is proposed will be built into a hillside reducing visibility and size and will allow wine to be made indoors instead of using an outdoor crush pad for fermentations. In addition, water use will be less than currently permitted though rainwater harvesting, reuse of winery process water and an underground vineyard irrigation system.

It is important that as a community, we support small, family-owned wineries, and that agriculture is our highest and best use for agriculturally zoned lands.

Thank you for your consideration of this letter and I hope that the Board affirms the Planning Commission's unanimous approval of Anthem Winery's application.

,

Sincerely,

Tom C. Davies President V. Sattui Winery 1111 White Lane St. Helena, CA 94574 HolmanTeague real estate law · land use law · business law · climate change law

August 25, 2020

Napa County Board of Supervisors 1195 Third Street, Suite 310 Napa, California 94559

Delivery via email to: Diane.Dillon@countyofnapa.org

RE: Appeals of the Planning Commission approval of the Anthem Winery Project (P14-00320-MOD, P14-000322-ECPA)

Chair Dillon:

The Applicant requests that the Board's September 1 hearing on the above referenced appeals be continued. While the Applicant wants to reach the end of a permitting process that has taken six years, the Applicant feels a continuance is appropriate given the current disruptions in our community. The LNU Lightning Complex fires have compounded the already difficult circumstances imposed by the global pandemic. With two local disasters declared at the same time, we recognize the Board of Supervisors time and attention is precious these days as evidenced by last week's special meeting and Dr. Reclusio's presentation next Tuesday.

We hope Appellants and County Staff will join in this request to postpone the appeal hearings, and we are ready to look at alternate dates. Thank you.

Respectfully,

/Rob Anglin/

Rob Anglin

cc: Chris Apallas Kathy Felch Kevin Block Julie Arbuckle

Chuck Wagner P. O. Box 268 Rutherford, Ca. 94573

August 26, 2020

Napa County Supervisors c/o Donald Barrella 1195 Third Street, Room 210 Napa, CA 94559 Donald.Barrella@countyofnapa.org

RE: In Support of Anthem Winery's Application to Modify Its Use Permit

Dear Supervisors,

I write in support of Julie and Justin Arbuckle's application to modify Anthem Winery's Use Permit. I understand that the Planning Commission unanimously approved the Arbuckles' application to: 1) substantially improve the safety of their winery's access road; 2) build a larger winery facility; and 3) allow tastings by appointment and occasional events instead of just 5 tastings a week. I hope that the Board will affirm the Planning Commission's unanimous approval of this project for several reasons.

<u>First</u>, the visitation and event levels approved are modest, especially when compared to similarly sized wineries that have come before the Planning Commission in the past decade. <u>Second</u>, the Arbuckles substantially reduced the scope of their project to address neighbor concerns, and at the request of several neighbors, agreed to withdraw their request for *any* increase in their currently permitted 30,000 gallon annual production limit. <u>Third</u>, the project incorporates an exemplary number of green, sustainability, and safety measures, including:

- The use of *less* water than currently permitted through substantial rainwater harvesting, recycling of winery process water, and a water-efficient underground irrigation system.
- An improved two lane access road that will have much better access for emergency vehicles and that will enable access between Redwood Rd. and Dry Creek Rd., as well as to neighboring parcels in the emergencies such as fires, landslides, and earthquakes a valuable benefit to the community.

- A wine production facility and caves that are built into the hillside near the center of the Arbuckles' property, minimizing the visibility and size of buildings to be located on the hilltop.
- A certified Napa Green winery in addition to the existing Napa Green vineyards.
- Numerous Best Management Practices and greenhouse gas reduction measures, including the solar rooftops, electric vehicle charging, and the plan to encourage employees and customers to carpool or ride their bikes.

All of these highly sustainable measures make Anthem Winery's project one that should be unanimously approved. Napa County's General Plan is clear that agriculture is the highest and best use of land, and the Arbuckles' careful planning maximizes the agricultural use of their land, and at the same time, reduces their approved water usage and improves emergency ingress and egress to and from the surrounding hillside.

Thank you for your time and consideration of these important issues, and for the opportunity to express my views. I sincerely hope that the Board affirms the Planning Commission's unanimous approval of Anthem Winery's application to modify its use permit so that the Arbuckles can proceed with their small winery project.

Sincerely, Auck Wan



August 20, 2020 Napa County Supervisors c/o Donald Barrella

RE: AFFIRMATION OF SUPPORT OF ANTHEM WINERY'S USE PERMIT MODIFICATION

Dear Supervisors,

The Planning Commission voted unanimously in favor of Anthem's Use Permit Modification. One neighbor has filed an appeal to you. Anthem Winery is not asking for much. Please help them to stay in business by approving their modest Use Permit Revisions.

Without direct to the consumer wine sales many small wineries will perish hurting the ag business in Napa County and diminishing the tax base. Ag is the highest and best use of the land. Please don't allow a neighbor or two, that probably moved to Napa County in recently years dictate to the ag business for their petty, selfish reasons.

Anthem has been good stewards of the land and will even bury, to a great extent, their new winery into the hill side. Anthem, in an effort to appease neighbors, has downsized their Use Permit modification request. Any further downsizing of this modification may jeopardize their very future existence.

Why do neighbors living in vineyard/ag areas often have more clout than those who farm the land and make the wine ? This is not right and could eventually destroy ag in Napa County.

You Supervisors know what is the right thing to do. Please do it and help save and perpetuate ag.

Sincerely,

4045 North Saint Helena Hwy & Calistoga, Ca. 94515 & Tel. 707.942.8200 & Fax 707.942.2103 www.castellodiamorosa.com