

“A”

## Recommended Findings

**PLANNING COMMISSION HEARING – APRIL 5, 2017  
RECOMMENDED FINDINGS**

**WHL WINERY  
USE PERMIT AND ROAD & STREET STANDARDS EXCEPTION REQUEST (P15-00215-UP)  
1561 SOUTH WHITEHALL LANE, ST. HELENA, CALIFORNIA  
(APN: 027-460-013)**

**ENVIRONMENTAL DETERMINATION:**

The Planning Commission (Commission) has received and reviewed the proposed Negative Declaration pursuant to the provisions of the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) and of Napa County's Local Procedures for Implementing CEQA, and finds that:

1. The Planning Commission has read and considered the Negative Declaration prior to taking action on said Negative Declaration and the proposed project.
2. The Negative Declaration is based on independent judgment exercised by the Planning Commission.
3. The Negative Declaration was prepared and considered in accordance with the requirements of the CEQA.
4. There is no substantial evidence in the record as a whole, that the project will have a significant effect on the environment.
5. There is no evidence, in considering the record as a whole that the proposed project will have a potential adverse effect on wildlife resources or habitat upon which the wildlife depends.
6. The site of this proposed project is not on any of the lists of hazardous waste sites enumerated under Government Code Section 65962.5 and is not within the boundaries of any airport land use plan.
7. The Secretary of the Commission is the custodian of the records of the proceedings on which this decision is based. The records are located at the Napa County Planning, Building & Environmental Services Department, 1195 Third Street, Second Floor, Napa, California.

**EXCEPTION TO ROAD AND STREET STANDARDS:**

The Commission has reviewed the attached described Road and Street Standards (RSS) Exception request in accordance with Road and Street Standards Section 3 and makes the following findings:

8. The exception will preserve unique features of the natural environment which includes, but is not limited to, natural water courses, steep slopes, geological features, heritage oak trees, or other trees of at least 6"dbh and found by the decision-maker to be of significant importance, but does not include man made environmental features such as vineyards, rock walls, ornamental or decorative landscaping, fences or the like.

Analysis: South Whitehall Lane is a shared private drive off Whitehall Lane which is a County maintained road. The project site is approximately 0.6 miles from Whitehall Lane. South Whitehall Lane is paved with widths that vary from 10 feet to 16 feet and crosses Bale Slough which runs along the easterly property line of the project site. Between roadway stations STA 36+50 to STA 37+65 (115 linear feet) South Whitehall Lane will have a minimum width of 14-feet over the stream. Road widening at the stream crossing would require substantial grading within and adjacent to the drainage course which would not be practical. Grant of the exception is necessary to minimize potential impacts to the existing Bale Slough stream crossing.

9. The exception is necessary to accommodate other limiting factors such as recorded historical sites or legal constraints.

Analysis: As noted above, South Whitehall Lane is a shared private drive off Whitehall Lane with widths that vary from 10 feet to 16 feet. An approximate 900 linear foot long portion of South Whitehall Lane is within an access easement that is 16 feet wide. The applicant provided written correspondence documenting the applicant's effort to seek consent from the neighboring property owners to widen the roadway easement but consent was refused. The applicant will improve the roadway within this portion to the extent possible while staying within the easement. Grant of the exception is necessary to accommodate this legal constraint.

10. Grant of the Road and Street Standards Exception will provide the same overall practical effect as the Standards do in providing defensible space, and does not adversely affect the life, safety, and welfare of the public or persons coming to the property.

Analysis: The County Engineering Division has discussed the request with the Napa County Fire Department and has conducted a site visit. Engineering staff recommends approval of the requested road exception, subject to recommended conditions in their memo of December 14, 2016. The proposed improvements are shown to meet the same overall practical effect of the RSS while preserving the unique features of the natural environment by implementing a vegetation management plan for the private lane (within the confines of the easement) and providing signage at each end of the roadway segments with reduced widths to warn motorists. There is adequate sight distance in both of these areas. The proposed improvements in the request, will serve as an alternate method by which adherence to the RSS may be achieved and will provide the same overall practical effect as the RSS towards providing defensible space, preserving the natural environment and protecting the life, safety and welfare of the public.

## **PLANNING AND ZONING ANALYSIS:**

### **USE PERMIT:**

The Commission has reviewed the use permit request in accordance with the requirements of the Napa County Code §18.124.070 and makes the following findings:

11. The Commission has the power to issue a Use Permit under the Zoning Regulations in effect as applied to property.

Analysis: The project is consistent with the AP (Agricultural Preserve) zoning district regulations. A winery (as defined in the Napa County Code Section 18.08.640) and uses in

connection with a winery (refer to Napa County Code Section 18.16.030) are permitted in the AP District with an approved use permit. The project, as conditioned, complies with the Napa County Winery Definition Ordinance (WDO) and all other requirements of the Zoning Code as applicable.

12. The procedural requirements for a Use Permit set forth in Chapter 18.124 of the Napa County Code (zoning regulations) have been met.

Analysis: The use permit application has been appropriately filed and notice and public hearing requirements have been met. The hearing notice and intent to adopt a Negative Declaration were posted and published in the Napa Valley Register on January 25, 2017. Copies were forwarded to property owners within 1,000 feet of the subject parcel, as well as other interested parties. The public comment period ran from January 25, 2017 to February 14, 2017.

13. The grant of the Use Permit, as conditioned, will not adversely affect the public health, safety or welfare of the County of Napa.

Analysis: Granting the Use Permit for the project as proposed and conditioned will not adversely affect the health, safety or welfare of the County. Affected County divisions and departments have reviewed the project and commented regarding the proposed driveway, grading, drainage, the proposed septic system, parking, building permits, and fire protection. Conditions are recommended which will incorporate these comments into the project to assure the protection of the public health, safety, and welfare.

14. The proposed use complies with applicable provisions of the Napa County Code and is consistent with the policies and standards of the Napa County General Plan and any applicable specific plan.

Analysis: Compliance with the Zoning Ordinance

The project is consistent with the AP (Agricultural Preserve) zoning district regulations. A winery (as defined in the Napa County Code Section 18.08.640) and uses in connection with a winery (refer to Napa County Code Section 18.16.030) are permitted in the AP District subject to an approved use permit. The proposed site improvements will comply with the development regulations of the AP District, including the minimum 300-foot road setback for winery buildings and 35-foot maximum building height as prescribed in County Code Sections 18.104.010, 18.104.220 and 18.104.230. The project, as conditioned, complies with the Napa County Winery Definition Ordinance (WDO) and all other requirements of the Zoning Code as applicable.

Analysis: Compliance with the General Plan

As proposed and as conditioned, the requested Use Permit is consistent with the overall goals and objectives of the General Plan (2008). The General Plan land use designation for the subject parcel is Agricultural Resource.

General Plan Agricultural Preservation and Land Use Goal AG/LU-1 guides the County to “preserve existing agricultural land uses and plan for agriculture and related activities as the primary land uses in Napa County.” General Plan Goal AG/LU-3 states that the County should “support the economic viability of agriculture, including grape growing, winemaking, other types of agriculture, and supporting industries to ensure the preservation of agricultural lands.” Goal AG/LU-3 and Policy AG/LU-2 recognize wineries as agricultural uses.

The proposed use of the property for fermenting and processing of grape juice into wine supports the economic viability of agriculture within the County, consistent with Goal AG/LU-3 and Policy AG/LU-4 (“The County will reserve agricultural lands for agricultural use including land used for grazing and watershed/open space...”). By authorizing a winery at the project site the requested Use Permit supports the economic viability of both the vineyard use on the property, consistent with Economic Development Goal E-1 and Policy E-1.

The “Right to Farm” is recognized throughout the General Plan and is specifically called out in Policy AG/LU-15 and in the County Code. “Right to Farm” provisions ensure that agriculture remains the primary land use in Napa County and is not threatened by potentially competing uses or neighbor complaints. Napa County’s adopted General Plan reinforces the County’s long-standing commitment to agricultural preservation, urban centered growth, and resource conservation.

See below for additional General Plan policies.

15. That the proposed use would not require a new water system or improvement causing significant adverse effects, either individually or cumulatively, on the affected groundwater basin in Napa County, unless that use would satisfy any of the other criteria specified for approval or waiver of a groundwater permit under Sections 13.15.070 or 13.15.080 of the County Code.

Analysis: The project is consistent with General Plan Conservation Policies CON-53 and CON-55, which require that applicants, who are seeking discretionary land use approvals, prove that adequate water supplies are available to serve the proposed use without causing significant negative impacts to shared groundwater resources. The subject property is located on the valley floor which is subject to a water use screening criteria of 1.0 acre-foot of water per acre of land per year. A Tier I Water Availability Analysis (WAA), dated May 6, 2016, was prepared by Applied Civil Engineering, Inc., to determine the estimated water use of the existing development, the proposed project and water availability. There is one existing well on the project site that currently serves the existing uses and will serve the proposed winery. The analysis indicates that existing uses on the site would have a typical annual water demand of 9.0 acre feet per year (af/yr). Vineyards account for 5.88 af/yr; the main dwelling and caretaker’s residence account for 1.45 af/yr; and, landscaping accounts for 1.63 af/yr. The proposed project would result in an annual water demand of 9.3 af/yr. According to the analysis, the winery would create an increase in annual water demand, by 0.28 af/yr and landscaping by 0.08 af/yr, totaling an approximate increase of 0.3 af/yr. Because the projected water demand for the project is below the calculated availability of 19.97 acre feet per year for the parcel, the requested Use Permit is consistent with General Plan Goals CON-10 and CON-11, as well as the policies mentioned above that support reservation and sustainable use of groundwater for agricultural and related purposes. The project will not require a new water system or other improvements and will not have a negative impact on local groundwater.

Other Applicable Napa County General Plan goals and policies:

- Goal AG/LU-1: Preserve existing agricultural land uses and plan for agriculture and related activities as the primary land uses in Napa County.
- Goal AG/LU-3: Support the economic viability of agriculture, including grape growing, winemaking, other types of agriculture, and supporting industries to ensure the preservation of agricultural lands.
- Policy AG/LU-2: “Agriculture” is defined as the raising of crops, trees, and livestock; the production and processing of agricultural products; and related marketing, sales and other accessory uses. Agriculture also includes farm management businesses and farm worker housing.
- Policy AG/LU-4: The County will reserve agricultural lands for agricultural use including lands used for grazing and watershed/open space, except for those lands which are shown on the Land Use Map as planned for urban development.
- Policy AG/LU-8: The County’s minimum agricultural parcel sizes shall ensure that agricultural areas can be maintained as economic units.
- Policy AG/LU-15: The County affirms and shall protect the right of agricultural operators in designated agricultural areas to commence and continue their agricultural practices (a “right to farm”), even though established urban uses in the general area may foster complaints against those agricultural practices. The “right to farm” shall encompass the processing of agricultural products and other activities inherent in the definition of agriculture provided in Policy AG/LU-2.
- Goal CON-10: Conserve, enhance and manage water resources on a sustainable basis to attempt to ensure that sufficient amounts of water will be available for the uses allowed by this General Plan, for the natural environment, and for future generations.
- Goal CON-11: Prioritize the use of available groundwater for agricultural and rural residential uses rather than for urbanized areas and ensure that land use decisions recognize the long-term availability and value of water resources in Napa County.
- Policy CON-60.5 All aspects of landscaping from the selection of plants to soil preparation and the installation of irrigation systems should be designed to reduce water demand, retain runoff, decrease flooding, and recharge groundwater.
- Policy CON-72: The County shall seek to reduce the energy impacts from new buildings by applying Title 24 energy standards as required by law and providing information to the public and builders on available energy conservation techniques, products, and methods available to exceed those standards by 15 percent or more.
- Policy CON-77: All new discretionary projects shall be evaluated to determine potential significant project-specific air quality impacts and shall be required to incorporate appropriate design, construction, and operational features to reduce emissions of criteria pollutants regulated by the state and federal

governments below the applicable significance standard(s) or implement alternate and equally effective mitigation strategies consistent with BAAQMD's air quality improvement programs to reduce emissions. In addition to these policies, the County's land use policies discourage scattered development which contributes to continued dependence on the private automobile as the only means of convenient transportation. The County's land use policies also contribute to efforts to reduce air pollution.

Policy CON-81: The County shall require dust control measures to be applied to construction projects consistent with measures recommended for use by the BAAQMD [Bay Area Air Quality Management District].

Goal E-1: Maintain and enhance the economic viability of agriculture.

Policy E-1: The County's economic development will focus on ensuring the continued viability of agriculture in Napa County.

Policy SAF-20: All new development shall comply with established fire safety standards. Design plans shall be referred to the appropriate fire agency for comment as to:

- 1) Adequacy of water supply.
- 2) Site design for fire department access in and around structures.
- 3) Ability for a safe and efficient fire department response.
- 4) Traffic flow and ingress/egress for residents and emergency vehicles.
- 5) Site-specific built-in fire protection.
- 6) Potential impacts to emergency services and fire department response.