"J"

Winery Comparison Analysis And Summary of Changes

Vine Cliff Winery Permit #P17-00129-MOD

Summary of Location and Operation Criteria

LOCATIONAL CRITERIA	STAFF COMMENTS
Size of Parcel	±99.59 acres
Proximity of Nearest Residence	1500 feet
Number of Wineries Located Within One Mile	11
Located Within the Napa Valley Business Park (AKA	n/a
Airport Industrial Area)	
Primary Road Currently or Projected to be Level of	
Service D or Below	Silverado Trail
Primary Road a Dead End	n/a
Located Within a Flood Zone	n/a
Located Within a Municipal Reservoir Watershed Located Within a State Responsibility Area or Fire Hazard Severity Zone Located Within an Area of Expansive Soils Located Within a Protected County Viewshed Result in the Loss of Sensitive Habitat	n/a Yes No Yes No
OPERATIONAL CRITERIA	STAFF COMMENTS
Napa Green Certified or Other Related Program	No
Percentage of Estate Grapes Proposed	100
Number of Proposed Variances	None
Wastewater Processed On-Site	yes

Vine Cliff Winery Permit #P17-00129-MOD

Summary of Location and Operation Criteria

Voluntary Greenhouse Gas Emission Reduction	
Voluntary Greenhouse Gas Emission Reduction Measures Proposed	Planned generation of on-site renewable energy with the installation of ground mount PV array; construction of the approved but not built mixed use structure will aspire to CALGREEN Tier 1 or Tier 2 standards and propose to exceed Title 24 energy efficiency standards; a vehicle miles traveled (VMT) reduction plan; continued use of energy conserving lighting; energy star roof/living roof/cool roof is used on the roof of tunnel between barrel storage room and winery building and will implement Energy Star roofing in future reroofing; promote bicycle incentives; connect to recycled water when it becomes available; maintain installed water efficient fixtures; approved future structure will be designed to minimize earthmoving; continued recycling 75% of all waste; maintain shade trees planted within 40 feet of the south side of building elevation; an electrical vehicle charging station; the existing site design is oriented and designed to optimize conditions for natural heating, cooling and day lighting of interior spaces and to maximum winery sun exposure such as a cave; continue local food production; will educate staff and visitors on sustainable practices; continue to use 70-80% cover crop; and retain biomass removed via pruning and thinning by chipping the material and reusing it rather than burning on-site.
Vanpools, Flexible Work Shifts, Shuttles, or Other Traffic Congestion Management Strategies Proposed Violations Currently Under Investigation	Approval of use permit to resolve violation
Violations Currently Under Investigation High Efficiency Water Use Measures Proposed	Approval of use permit to resolve violation
	yes
Existing Vineyards Proposed to be Removed	no
On-Site Employee or Farmworker Housing Proposed	no
Site Served by a Municipal Water Supply	no
Site Served by a Municipal Sewer System	no
Recycled Water Use Proposed	no
New Vineyards Plantings Proposed	no
Hold & Haul Proposed: Temporary (Duration of	
Time) or Permanent	no
Trucked in Water Proposed	no

Vine Cliff Winery Permit #P17-00129-MOD

Wineries Within One Mile of APN: 032-030-027

					Tours/	Weekly	Number of Marketing	
Name	Address	Bldg Size	Cave Size	Production	Tastings	Visitors	Events	Employees
Ovid Vineyards	275 Long Ranch Rd, St. Helena	12,363	0	18,000	Appt	245	8	4
Dalla Valle Vineyards	7776 Silverado Trail, Napa	7070	0	20,000	No	0	0	3
Rudd Estate Winery	500 Oakville Cross Road, Napa	10,088	22,000	75,000	Appt	250	33	15
Gargiulo Winery	545 Oakville Cross Road, Napa	7550	0	20,000	Appt	70	12	2
Tench Winery	7631 Silverado Trail, Napa	6779	6245	42,840	Appt	98	3	10
B Cellars	701 Oakville Cross Road, Napa	21552	22946	45,000	Appt	250	16	10
Nemerever Winery	711 Oakville Cross Road, Napa	4092	3356	10,000	Appt	24	6	1
Screaming Eagle	7557 Silverado Trail, St. Helena	22333	16,000	20,000	Appt	15	0	5
Paraduxx Vineyards	7257 Silverado Trail, St. Helena	32909	0	200,000	Appt	350	257	38
Perata Winery	1278 State Lane, Yountville	4780	0	20,000	Appt	50	14	2
Oakville Ranch	7781 Silverado Trail, Napa	2354		5,000	Appt	0	0	2

Vine Cliff Winery Permit #P17-00129-MOD Winery Comparison (48,000-50,000 Gallons)

BY APPOINTMENT WINERIES

BY APPOINTMENT WINERIES							Annual	Number of			
				Daily	Weekly	Annual	Marketing	Marketing	Annual		
Name	Bldg Size	Cave Size	Production	Visitors	Visitors	Visitors	Visitors	Events	Visitation	Acres	Location
BROWN ESTATE VINEYARDS	2704	6000	50000	2	2	104	220	9	324	130.46	Chiles Valley
DEL DOTTO FAMILY WINERY	4200	15163	48000	0	200	10400	1146	31	11546	10	valley floor
ITALICS WINERY	15880	16500	50000	20	50	2600	390	8	2990	45.98	MST
GAMBLE FAMILY VINEYARDS	32760	0	50000	30	300	15600	1410	34	17010	11.17	valley floor
ROBERT FOLEY VINEYARDS	1760	12350	50000	10	60	3120	244	14	3364	13.04	Angwin
SHUTTERS WINERY	9034	11600	50000	18	40	2080	1000	26	3080	13.36	hillside
WOOLLS RANCH WINERY	20882	0	50000	60	350	18200	4640	76	22840	236.66	hillside
CAIRDEAN WINERY	24370	16500	50000	25	175	9100	1400	50	10500	50.31	hillside
NORMAN ALUMBAUGH WINERY	21052	0	50000	20	140	7280	244	8	7524	80.92	Pope Valley
BALLENTINE WINERY	7400	0	50000	0	10	520	0	0	520	21.12	valley floor
PIAZZA DEL DOTTO	17923	15970	48000	0	200	10400	1146	31	11546	10.08	valley floor
HAGAFEN CELLARS	6800	0	50000	25	150	7800	725	12	8525	12.28	valley floor
BENNETT LANE WINERY	17550	0	50000	32	200	10400	2495	55	12895	10	valley floor
VINEYARD 29	17804	14038	48500	0	30	1560	660	17	2220	24.64	hillside
TWO ROCKS WINERY	6950	20682	50000	6	15	780	920	13	1700	46.66	hillside
WHEELER FARMS WINERY	31085	0	50000	32	224	11648	1452	52	13100	11.66	valley floor
CALISTOGA ARTISAN VILLAGE			48000	40	240	12480	384	8	12864	21.97	valley floor
NAPA VALLEY RESERVE	26130	42000	48000	6	20	1040	4540	266	5580	63.7	hillside
PRIDE MOUNTAIN VINEYARDS	5400	14000	50000	20	20	1040	1060	49	2100	22.27	hillside
MEADOWOOD LANE WINERY	9520	15000	48000	19	90	4680	1140	50	5820	14.7	hillside
FOLIE A DEUX	9700	0	50000	50	350	18200	0	0	18200	3	valley floor
TOM EDDY WINERY	10200	21437	48000	0	20	1040	309	8	1349	14.59	hillside
LAST RESORT WINERY	9839	0	50000	20	140	7280	720	12	8000	55.44	Pope Valley
ALTAMURA WINERY	11800	3115	50000	0	20	1040	0	0	1040	58.59	Wooden Valley
REFUGE WINERY	18875	0	50000	124	868	45136	3370	115	48506	13.23	valley floor
AVERAGE CALCULATION	14151	9348	49460	22	157	8141	1185	38	9326	39.83	
MEDIAN CALCULATION	11000	8800	50000	20	140	7280	920	17	7524	21.12	
Vine Cliff Winery (APPROVED)	7,780	15,000	48,000		0	100	1916	134	2016		hillside
Vine Cliff Winery (PROPOSED)	7,780	15,000	48,000	50	350	18,200	2516	140	20716	99.6	hillside

Vine Cliff Winery Permit #P17-00129 Winery Comparison (48000-50,000 Gallons)

PRE-WDO WINERIES

							Annual	Number of			
				Daily	Weekly	Annual	Marketing	Marketing	Annual		
Name	Bldg Size	Cave Size	Production	Visitors	Visitors	Visitors	Visitors	Events	Visitation	Acres	Location
BUEHLER VINEYARDS	12187	0	50000	0	0	0	0	0	0	47.76	hillside
CHATEAU BOSWELL	7200	10860	48000	30	210	10920	0	0	10920	9.12	hillside
MADONNA ESTATE - MONT ST JOHN CELLA	15280	0	50000	0	50	2600	0	0	2600	4.37	Carneros
NIEBAUM COPPOLA ESTATE NIEBAUM LN	30090	0	50000	20	15	780	1170	41	1950	78.76	hillside
ROBERT KEENAN WINERY	10006	0	50000	35	245	12740	1050	21	13790	147.39	hillside
CHATEAU POTELLE	5790	0	48000	36	250	13000	0	0	13000	122.68	hillside
LOKOYA	16712	0	50000	30	70	3640	720	24	4360	72.55	hillside
AVERAGE CALCULATION	13895	1551	49429	22	120	6240	980	29	7770	68.95	
MEDIAN CALCULATION	12187	0	50000	30	70	7280	1050	24	7640	72.55	

Vine Cliff Winery (APPROVED)	7,780	15,000	48,000	0	0	100	1916	134	2016	99.6 hillside
Vine Cliff Winery (PROPOSED)	7,780	15,000	48,000	50	350	18,200	2516	140	20,716	99.6 hillside

VINE CLIFF WINERY MODIFICATION #P17-00129 SUMMARY OF CHANGES

Existisng Conditions		Proposed Request	Net Change Analyzed
Visitation:			
100 Visitors/Year, 4 Maximum		50 Visitors/Day	Net increase of 46 Visitors/Day
28 Visitors/Week		350 Visitors/Week	Net increase of 322 Visitors/Week
100 Visitors/Year		18,200 visitor/Year	Net increase of 18,100 Visitors/Year
Marketing Program			
Wine Trade Tours & Tasting Two(2)/week, maximum 4 guests	Wine Trade Tours & Tasting Two(2)/week, maximum 4 guests	
Wine Trade Luncheon 2/Month, m	naximum 50 guests	Wine Trade Luncheon 2/Month, maximum 50 guests	
Private Promotional Dinners 6/ye	ar maximum 50 guests	Private Promotional Dinners 6/year maximum 50 guests Additional Marketing Events 6/year, maximum100 guests	
134 Total Events		140 Total Events	Net increase 6 Total Events
1916 Total Marketing Guests/Year	-	2516 Guests/Year	Net increase 600 guests
Employees			
Two (2) full-time employees		Ten full time employees	Net increase of four (4) full-time employees
Two (2) part-time employees		Six (6) part-time employees	Net increase of four (4) full-time employees
4 Total Employees		16 Total Employees	Net increase of 12 employees