

INTRODUCTION

In January 2013, Architectural Resources Group was engaged by Treasury Wine Estates to provide a Secretary of the Interior Standards Evaluation for a proposed ADA improvement on the historic Manor House at the Stags’ Leap Winery complex. Subsequent to this evaluation, ARG has been engaged to also provide a compliance evaluation for the historic elements along the Access Drive and for the historic stone landscape elements that border the roadways within the historic site.

This revised evaluation includes the following:

- Existing Access Drive Road Improvements/Exceptions by Summit Engineering, Inc. described in the letter dated February 5, 2013 (revised March 12, 2013), as well as Drawings C1-C4 dated March 12, 2013;
- Road Improvements/Exceptions in four locations within the historic Stags’ Leap Winery site in the documents described above (areas identified are noted on plans);
- Manor House ADA Access improvement including modification of a window into an accessible door on the east elevation, and construction of an accessible pathway and ADA restroom.

A number of previous reports and studies have identified the Stags’ Leap Winery complex as eligible for both the National Register of Historic Places and the California Register of Historic Resources. These sources have been reviewed as a part of preparing this evaluation, including the Historic Structure Report prepared in 1998 by Clark Historical Research Consultants, the Cultural Resources Survey prepared in 1999 by Jay Flaherty (with contribution by Roger Werner), and the Stags Leap Winery Access Road Inspection and Analysis prepared in 2000 by ASI Archaeology and Cultural Resources Management. These sources have been listed at the end of this report, and can be made available upon request.

**Secretary of the Interior Standards for Rehabilitation – Evaluation
Stags’ Leap Winery – Access Drive, Historic Site Roadways and Manor House**

January 24, 2013 revised March 13, 2013

Page 2

As an ‘historical resource’, the project is subject to review under the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA). However, under CEQA Guidelines 15331 Class 31, projects that follows *Standards for Rehabilitation (Rehabilitation Standards)* contained within *The Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties* are exempt. It is important to note that the historic features of the access drive and landscape features throughout the historic site have been determined to be contributing features to the potential Stags’ Leap Winery historic district, and are subject to evaluation according to the Standards. The Access Road was built as part of the historic complex. The features constructed during the period(s) within which the complex attained its historic significance, and that retain their physical integrity, are potentially eligible for the National Register, by their association with the complex. Likewise, historic landscape features within the site are considered contributing features and subject to evaluation.

ACCESS DRIVE

According to the Cultural Resources Survey prepared by Jay Flaherty in 1999, the Access Road is an integral component of the historic Stags’ Leap Winery complex and the historic features that contribute to its significance include the following:

- The original alignment and grade scale from Silverado Trail east to the left turn into the Red Tail facility. This includes bi-level grading of the western-most parts of the access road and the associated stone retaining walls;
- Native and non-native vegetation including the avenue of black walnut trees west of the bridge and avenue of oak trees east of the bridge;
- The stone bridge and interconnected stone walls and creek bank riprap
- The stone wall east of the bridge and north of the access road; and
- The low stone wall at the intersection where the access road forks off to the south into the historic winery.

**Secretary of the Interior Standards for Rehabilitation – Evaluation
Stags’ Leap Winery – Access Drive, Historic Site Roadways and Manor House**

January 24, 2013 revised March 13, 2013

Page 3

In addition to the historic resources identified above, the Napa Valley Grapegrowers have placed Stags’ Leap Winery vineyards on the ‘Historic Vineyard Registry’, as identified in the enclosed letter. The historic vineyard (Block 5 on the attached vineyard map) is located on the south side of the Access Road, directly adjacent to and running the entire length of the avenue of black walnut trees. This vineyard includes the Petite Syrah field blend block, planted in the late 1920s, that survives to the present day and is the source of the Estate Grown ‘Ne Cede Malis’. DNA research conducted on this block indicates it was planted from material already existing on the estate, which may date to the late 1880s.

Secretary of the Interior Standards Compliance

The proposed project includes a number of road improvements/exceptions, as outlined in Summit Engineering, Inc.’s letter dated February 5, 2013 (revised March 12, 2013), as well as Drawings C1-C4 dated March 12, 2013. The work described in Area 1 – Area 5 occur along the access road. The compliance of the proposed road improvements / exceptions for each area is reviewed below with respect to the *Rehabilitation Standards*.

The *Standards* that apply to the proposed work are Standards #2 and #5, which are described below:

2. *The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved.
The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces
that characterize a property shall be avoided.*

5. *Distinctive features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples
of craftsmanship that characterize a historic property shall be
preserved.*

**Secretary of the Interior Standards for Rehabilitation – Evaluation
Stags’ Leap Winery – Access Drive, Historic Site Roadways and Manor House**

January 24, 2013 revised March 13, 2013

Page 4

Area 1: Exception request for roadway width due to existing elevation difference and split road configuration.

The existing rock retaining wall in this area was identified as a contributing historic resource in the ASI report prepared in 2000. ‘A rock retaining wall composed of unmortared natural stone separates the two pavement sections of the access road. The stable and aesthetically pleasing wall is composed of individually selected and skillfully arranged field stones, similar in nature and quality to the stonework of the original Manor house.’

The proposed exception is consistent with Standards #2 and #5, as it will allow the historic rock wall to be retained and preserved, to remain as an example of the distinctive masonry craftsmanship that characterizes the Stags’ Leap property.

Area 2: Exception request for roadway width due to existing elevation difference and split road configuration.

The existing rock wall is similar to the wall described in Area 1, above, and has also been identified as a contributing historic resource in the ASI report.

The proposed exception is consistent with Standards #2 and #5 as it will allow the historic rock wall to be retained and preserved, to remain as an example of the distinctive masonry craftsmanship that characterizes the Stags’ Leap property.

Area 3: Exception request for roadway width due to existing mature trees, turnouts and excellent sight distance.

**Secretary of the Interior Standards for Rehabilitation – Evaluation
Stags’ Leap Winery – Access Drive, Historic Site Roadways and Manor House**

January 24, 2013 revised March 13, 2013

Page 5

The existing avenue of trees forms a distinctive historic design element and has been identified as a contributing resource. The trees have been identified as California Black Walnut (letter from Pacific Tree Care, enclosed). Based on photographs from the 1920s (Image 1), this avenue retains a high degree of integrity, and was an important feature in the arrival experience for the historic property, as the road transitioned from the natural oak woodland to a wide flat valley. The avenue of trees is flanked by vineyards on both sides, on the south side by Stags’ Leap historic vineyard (Image 2 and 3).

The proposed exception is consistent with Standard #2, as it will allow the historic avenue of black walnut trees to be retained and preserved. The significant characteristics of the avenue are maintained, as well, which include the roadway, an unpaved area between the road and the line of trees, and the vineyards beyond. Widening the existing turnouts will not cause a significant impact, as they have been located where there is adequate distance between the existing trees, and where there is adequate depth such that 20 feet will not encroach on the historic vineyard. The proposed widening of the shoulders will be achieved with gravel, so the paved area does not encroach to close to the line of trees.

Area 4: Exception requested for roadway width due to stream setbacks and historic stone bridge.

The historic stone bridge is constructed of stone set in mortar, supported by a Roman style arch (Image 4). A series of loose laid stone walls line the creek, while the banks of the creek are covered with a field stone riprap. The bridge and associated walls have been identified as contributing resources.

The proposed exception is consistent with Standards #2 and #5 as it will allow the historic stone bridge and associated stone walls to be retained and preserved, to remain as an

**Secretary of the Interior Standards for Rehabilitation – Evaluation
Stags’ Leap Winery – Access Drive, Historic Site Roadways and Manor House**

January 24, 2013 revised March 13, 2013

Page 6

example of the distinctive masonry craftsmanship that characterizes the Stags’ Leap property.

Area 5: Exception requested for roadway width due to stream setbacks and mature trees.

The roadway east of the stone bridge is lined with blue oaks on the south side and bay trees interspersed with walnuts on the north side. The north side of the road follows the alignment of an existing stream. Similar to what was described above for the avenue of black walnuts, this section of tree lined road has been identified as a contributing resource (Image 5).

The proposed exception is consistent with Standard #2, as it will allow the historic avenue of trees to be retained and preserved. The proposed new turnout will be constructed without the removal of any trees.

Conclusion

The improvements/exceptions proposed for the Access Road meet the Secretary of the Interior Standards for Rehabilitation. As a result of meeting the Standards, this portion of the project can be considered as mitigated to a level of less than a significant impact on the historic resources.

It is important to note that the proposed project includes requests for exceptions. These exceptions avoid actions that would have a significant negative impact on the historic resources. If these exceptions are denied, this portion of the project will not meet the Standards, and cannot be considered to mitigate impacts to historical resources to a less-than-significant level under CEQA.

ROADS AND STONE WALLS – HISTORIC SITE

In 2000, Architectural Resources Group conducted a preliminary Historic Landscape Assessment and Chronology of the Stags’ Leap property. This study identified the significance of the roadway patterns, stone walls, and steps as the primary organizing elements of the site. Some existing features have been in place since 1890, with the majority of the elements being present since the 1920s. The following historic features that contribute to the site’s significance, and are impacted by the project, include the following:

- Entry Road and Stone Gate
- Lower drive and surrounding stone walls at front lawn
- Roadway to Winery and surrounding stone walls at terraced gardens

Secretary of the Interior Standards Compliance

The proposed project for this area includes a number of road improvements/exceptions, as outlined in Summit Engineering, Inc.’s letter dated February 5, 2013 (revised March 12, 2013), as well as Drawings C1-C4 dated March 12, 2013. The work described in Area 6 – Area 9 occur within the historic property. The compliance of the proposed road improvements / exceptions for each area is reviewed below with respect to the *Rehabilitation Standards*. The same standards as were applicable to the Access Road will apply to these elements of the project.

Area 6: Exception requested for roadway width due to existing stone pillars.

The existing stone pillars and associated stone walls define the entrance to the historic site (Image 6). These elements date from the 1890s, and are a significant historic resource.

**Secretary of the Interior Standards for Rehabilitation – Evaluation
Stags’ Leap Winery – Access Drive, Historic Site Roadways and Manor House**

January 24, 2013 revised March 13, 2013

Page 8

The proposed exception is consistent with Standards #2 and #5 as it will allow the historic stone pillars and walls to be retained and preserved, to remain as an example of the distinctive masonry craftsmanship that characterizes the Stags’ Leap property. The proposed pull-out is located in an area where no vegetation needs to be removed, so has minimal impact. Improvements to widen the shoulder will also have minimal impact.

Area 7, 8 and 9: Exceptions requested for roadway width due to existing retaining walls.

The existing roadways and stone retaining walls are significant historic resources, as they are the primary organizing elements of the site. The roadways identified in the areas of work include the circular road around the Lower Lawn and the road leading from the Manor House to the Winery (Image 8). Both of these roadways were established in the 1890s, with the stone walls dating from both the 1890s and the 1920s (Image 7 and 9).

The proposed exception is consistent with Standards #2 and #5 as it will allow the historic roadways and stone walls to be retained and preserved, to remain as an example of the distinctive masonry craftsmanship that characterizes the Stags’ Leap property. The proposed road widening will not impact stone features, so will have minimal impact. The proposed new pullout in front of the winery will not impact landscape features or stone walls, so will have minimal impact.

Conclusion

The improvements/exceptions proposed for the roadways of the historic site meet the Secretary of the Interior Standards for Rehabilitation. As a result of meeting the Standards, this portion of the project can be considered as mitigated to a level of less than a significant impact on the historic resources.

As was the case for the Access Road work, it is important to note that the proposed project includes requests for exceptions. These exceptions avoid actions that would have a significant negative impact on the historic resources. If these exceptions are denied, this portion of the project will not meet the Standards, and cannot be considered to mitigate impacts to historical resources to a less-than-significant level under CEQA.

MANOR HOUSE ADA IMPROVEMENTS

The Stags’ Leap Manor House is a two-story stone structure constructed c.1890. The main floor of the Manor House is raised above grade, with a main entry door on the west façade off of a wrap around porch (Images 10 and 11). The current owner, Treasury Wine Estates, has developed a project to provide disabled access to the main floor of the Manor House.

The project proposes to provide an accessible entrance on the south side of the building where the existing slope of the site makes it possible to enter the first floor at grade. An existing window opening will be modified to create a disabled accessible door at grade level. Numerous design alternatives were studied in the process of selecting the proposed design, including a portable ramp on the east side of the porch, as well as a portable lift on the south side of the porch. Due to existing elevation issues for path of travel for the ramp alternative, and aesthetic impacts on the historic structure for the portable lift alternative, the south elevation window modification has been selected as the most appropriate solution for the historic building.

Secretary of the Interior Standards Compliance

The compliance of the proposed Manor House ADA project is reviewed below with respect to the *Rehabilitation Standards*. Each of the Standards are listed below in italics,

**Secretary of the Interior Standards for Rehabilitation – Evaluation
Stags’Leap Winery – Access Drive, Historic Site Roadways and Manor House**

January 24, 2013 revised March 13, 2013

Page 10

with a response providing a discussion regarding the proposed project’s consistency or inconsistency with each standard.

1. A property shall be used for its historic purpose or be placed in a new use that requires minimal change to the defining characteristics of the building and its site and environment.

The proposed project is consistent with this Standard. The proposed wine tasting use for the historic masonry Manor House will cause minimal alterations to the character defining features of the building.

2. The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.

The proposed project is consistent with this Standard. The sole alteration proposed is the conversion of a window on the south elevation into an accessible entry. This existing window is located on a non-primary elevation, situated toward the back of the building. The existing window has a very low sill height, so less than a course of stone will need to be removed to allow a disabled accessible door at grade.

3. Each property shall be recognized as a physical record of its time, place, and use. Changes that create a false sense of historical development, such as adding conjectural features or architectural elements from other buildings, shall not be undertaken.

The proposed project is consistent with this Standard. No features or elements that would create a false sense of history are proposed in the project.

4. Most properties change over time; those changes that have achieved historic significance in their own right shall be retained and preserved.

The proposed project is consistent with this Standard. The historic building is being retained in its current configuration, including alterations that have been constructed over time.

5. Distinctive features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a historic property shall be preserved.

The proposed project is consistent with this Standard. The masonry detailing around the existing window will be retained in the proposed modification to a door.

6. Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence.

The proposed project is consistent with this Standard. The proposed project does not include replacement of any character defining features.

**Secretary of the Interior Standards for Rehabilitation – Evaluation
Stags’Leap Winery – Access Drive, Historic Site Roadways and Manor House**

January 24, 2013 revised March 13, 2013

Page 12

7. Chemical or physical treatments, such as sandblasting, that cause damage to historic materials shall not be used. The surface cleaning of structures, if appropriate, shall be undertaken using the gentlest means possible.

The proposed project is generally with this Standard. Surface cleaning is not proposed for this project.

8. Significant archaeological resources affected by a project shall be protected and preserved. If such resources must be disturbed, mitigation measures shall be undertaken.

No known archaeological resources exist on the site. If resources are uncovered during the course of construction, an archaeologist will be brought in to provide on-site monitoring.

9. New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.

The proposed project is consistent with this Standard. The work proposed for the Manor House includes only the alteration of the window opening into a accessible door. The new door will be a wood panel door, compatible with the existing doors on the building. It will be 3’-0” wide, to meet current accessibility codes, which will differentiate it from the width of the original doors. Since the existing window opening is wider than 3’-0”, the design will include sidelites, which is a

**Secretary of the Interior Standards for Rehabilitation – Evaluation
Stags’ Leap Winery – Access Drive, Historic Site Roadways and Manor House**

January 24, 2013 revised March 13, 2013

Page 13

composition that is compatible with other large openings, such as the adjacent leaded glass window (Images 12 and 13).

10. New additions and adjacent or related new construction shall be undertaken in such a manner that if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.

The proposed project is consistent with this Standard. In the future, the accessible door could be removed and the window reinstalled in the original opening.

Conclusion

The proposed alteration of the window into an accessible entry door on the non-primary elevation of the historic Stags’ Leap Manor House is a minor alteration, and meets the Secretary of the Interior Standards for Rehabilitation. As a result of meeting the Standards, the ADA improvement project can be considered as mitigated to a level of less than a significant impact on the historic resource.

Prepared by:



Naomi Miroglio

Principal

**Secretary of the Interior Standards for Rehabilitation – Evaluation
Stags'Leap Winery – Access Drive, Historic Site Roadways and Manor House**

January 24, 2013 revised March 13, 2013

Page 14



Image 1. Avenue of Black Walnut Trees and vineyard c1926 - View from west



Image 2. Existing Avenue of Black Walnut Trees – View from west

**Secretary of the Interior Standards for Rehabilitation – Evaluation
Stags’Leap Winery – Access Drive, Historic Site Roadways and Manor House**

January 24, 2013 revised March 13, 2013

Page 15



Image 3. Historic Vineyard ‘Ne Cede Malis’ – View from northwest



Image 4. Historic Stone Bridge – View from east

ARCHITECTURAL RESOURCES GROUP
Architects, Planners & Conservators, Inc.

**Secretary of the Interior Standards for Rehabilitation – Evaluation
Stags'Leap Winery – Access Drive, Historic Site Roadways and Manor House**

January 24, 2013 revised March 13, 2013

Page 16



Image 5. Avenue of Trees east of stone bridge – View from east



Image 6. Entry Drive Stone Gates and Walls – View from north

ARCHITECTURAL RESOURCES GROUP
Architects, Planners & Conservators, Inc.

**Secretary of the Interior Standards for Rehabilitation – Evaluation
Stags'Leap Winery – Access Drive, Historic Site Roadways and Manor House**

January 24, 2013 revised March 13, 2013

Page 17



Image 7. Lower Lawn Stone Walls and Road c 1926– View from west



Image 8. Roadway leading to Winery and associated stone walls – view from southwest

**Secretary of the Interior Standards for Rehabilitation – Evaluation
Stags'Leap Winery – Access Drive, Historic Site Roadways and Manor House**

January 24, 2013 revised March 13, 2013

Page 18



Image 9. Garden Terrace overlooking Lower Lawn stone walls c.1926 – view from northeast



Image 10. Stags Leap Manor House and Lower Lawn stone walls – View from southwest

**Secretary of the Interior Standards for Rehabilitation – Evaluation
Stags’Leap Winery – Access Drive, Historic Site Roadways and Manor House**

January 24, 2013 revised March 13, 2013

Page 19



Image 11. Stags' Leap Manor House – View from west



Image 12. Stags' Leap Manor House –south elevation

ARCHITECTURAL RESOURCES GROUP
Architects, Planners & Conservators, Inc.

**Secretary of the Interior Standards for Rehabilitation – Evaluation
Stags’ Leap Winery – Access Drive, Historic Site Roadways and Manor House**

January 24, 2013 revised March 13, 2013

Page 20



Image 13. Stags’ Leap Manor House – window to be modified into ADA entrance

**Secretary of the Interior Standards for Rehabilitation – Evaluation
Stags'Leap Winery – Access Drive, Historic Site Roadways and Manor House**

January 24, 2013 revised March 13, 2013

Page 21

Sources:

Werner, Roger H., and R. Paul Hampson, ASI Archaeology and Cultural Resources
Management

2000 Stags Leap Winery Access Road Inspection and Analysis

Clark, Susan, and Holly Woods

1998 *Stags Leap Winery 6150 Silverado Trail, Yountville, Napa County California 95449*
Assessors parcel numbers 32-013-013, 32-530-014, 32-530-17, 32-530-018 Historic
Structures Report Estate House and Estate. Report prepared for Beringer Wine Estates,
St. Helena, California

Flaherty, Jay M. (with contribution by Roger H. Werner)

1999 *Cultural Resources Survey of 240 +/- Acres near Yountville, Napa County,*
California (Stags Leap Winery Proposed Winery Expansion). Report prepared for Summit
Engineering, Santa Rosa, California



March 11, 2013

Ms. Debra Dommen
Vice President, Government and Community Relations
Treasury Wine Estates
610 Airpark Road
Napa, CA 94558

Dear Debra,

The Napa Valley Grapegrowers (NVG) Historic Vineyard Registry (Registry) project is a landmark project designed to give the greater Napa Valley new recognition as an established, world-class grapegrowing region with documented historic roots. The Napa Valley wine industry has a 175-year old tradition of grapegrowing and winemaking, and that story gives historic significance to our region as a whole.

In 2008 – 2009, the NVG worked with Rue Ziegler, PhD in cultural anthropology, and Matt Lamborn of PacGeo Data, to complete Phase I of this project. Phase I includes a database of over 1,800 historic Napa County grapegrower & winemaker records from 1838 to 1915. This letter is to confirm that the vineyards owned by Horace Blanchard Chase in the Stag's Leap district are included in Phase I the NVG Registry project.

Sincerely,

Jennifer K. Putnam
Executive Director

www.napagrowers.org

To Preserve and Promote Napa Valley's World-Class Vineyards



STAGS' LEAP WINERY ESTATE VINEYARDS



ENGRAVING COPYRIGHT © 2004 ROBERTO ROVIRA, ALL RIGHTS RESERVED

CABERNET
SAUVIGNON

PETITE
SYRAH

MERLOT

PACIFIC TREE CARE

Joseph A. Schneider Certified Arborist WE-0156

Jacob I. Schneider Certified Arborist WE-5478

William V. Perez III "Trey" WE-7367A

March 11, 2013

Treasury Wine Estates
Debra Dommen
PO Box 4500
610 Airpark Road
Napa, CA 94558

RE: 5766 Silverado Trail; Tree identification

Dear Debora,

Pursuant to your request, I made a site visit on March 4, 2013 to 5766 Silverado Trail. I met with you to identify several trees that border the driveway. I counted 67 trees that I identified to be California Black Walnut (*Juglans c. hindsii*) along the driveway entrance. If you have any questions regarding this matter please feel free to call me at 707-942-0261 to discuss.

Sincerely,



William V. Trey Perez III
ISA Certified Arborist WE-7583A

WVP:mm

Enclosure: Invoice 8063